Footscray CCTV System - Evaluating its Effectiveness.

Lynley Dumble
Presentation Overview

1. Setting the Scene
2. The Footscray CCTV system
3. Evaluation Framework
4. Evaluation Findings
5. Summary
Footscray – City of Maribyrnong

Gateway suburb of Melbourne’s West.

Culturally diverse - Footscray’s 13,138 residents come from 135 countries.

5 km from Melbourne’s CBD.

Traditional lands of the Kulin Nation.
• 1 of Melbourne’s 6 CADs
• 9000 new dwellings built between 2009-11.
• Major Transport Hub.
• Vibrant multicultural shopping hub, including the famous Footscray Market
• 100 restaurants – Vietnamese, Chinese, African
• Home of two campuses of Victoria University.
The Darker Side!

- Perception of Footscray as unsafe
  - Long history of street based illicit drug use and dealing.
  - Problematic public drinking.
  - Poor amenity
    - Graffiti & Roller Shutters.
    - Cleanliness
  - Quiet and inactive in the evening.
The Drivers for CCTV

• In October 2009, Footscray Police presented a **business case** to Council for CCTV in Footscray.

• Politically **“Time was Ripe”**
  – Many years of Footscray’s poor image and perceptions of safety.
  – Councillors wanting a solution to the anti social activity in Footscray.
Footscray Shared Approach to Safety

– Outreach services to public drinkers and injecting drug users.
– Amenity improvements – lighting, graffiti removal, streetscaping.
– Police foot patrols
– Police operations.
– Coordinated approach with Council, Services, DPCD and Police.
Footscray CCTV system

• Operational since June 2011
• 32 fixed and pan-tilt-zoom (PTZ) cameras.
• 16 locations.
Footscray CCTV system

- Jointly funded by Maribyrnong City Council and State Govt.
- System owned by Council – monitored by Footscray Police
• The camera zone is located within Footscray Central
CCTV Operation

• Footscray Police have Standard Operating Procedures (SOPs) for the system.

• Checked every 3 months by District Inspector for compliance.
• The main purpose of the Footscray Public Safety CCTV system is to improve perceptions of safety in Footscray Central.
Objectives of the System

- Reduce anti-social behaviour in Footscray Central.
- Reduce crime in Footscray Central.
- Disrupt the street-based drug trade (buying and selling) in Footscray Central.
- Support proactive policing to ensure timely and consistent police responses in Footscray Central.
- Gather evidence to support police prosecutions of crimes in Footscray Central.
Evaluation Framework

• The evaluation framework was established prior to the installation of the system to
  • Judge the overall effectiveness against the system objectives;
  • Identify any differential impacts on individuals or groups in the community;
  • Assess the rigour and effectiveness of operating procedures;
  • Assess the extent to which data handling complies with relevant legislation, standards and safeguards;
  • Assess the strategic effectiveness of the camera locations and recommend any extension / additional locations; and
  • Adjust data collection systems over time to improve evaluation and monitoring.
Data sources

• Existing Statistical data – Primarily Victorian Police LEAP and CAD data
• Specific purpose data – e.g local and municipal wide Perceptions of Safety Survey.
• Interviews and discussions with individuals from stakeholder groups
• Regular discussions with networks.
Evaluation Results

• Perceptions of safety
  – Highly subjective – age, income, gender, previous exposure to crime, individual resilience, media or factors that influence.
  – POS generally improving across Melbourne.
  – Metropolis Research commissioned to do baseline POS survey June 2011 and repeated July 2013.
Perceptions of safety scores 2011 Baseline Report and 2013 Perceptions of safety survey
Changes in perceptions of safety at night in Footscray Central for different groups of people
Has CCTV made people feel safer?

Impact of CCTV cameras on "making people feel safer"
Maribyrnong City Council - 2013 CCTV Camera Follow Up survey
(Index score scale 0 - 10)
What stakeholders say?

• Local Traders – Has CCTV made a difference? No (7) - Yes (18)
  • “The camera’s have reduced crime a lot, especially in the Mall and around Little Saigon. It used to be a real problem in these areas. People forget what it was like, I think”
  • ”Yes, Footscray is definitely safer now. People know that they are being watched and behave themselves more.”
  • “CCTV doesn’t change anything much. People don’t take any notice of them”.
  • ”I can’t say that Footscray is any safer because of the cameras. Perhaps there are more Police around, so that has helped”.

Maribyrnong City Council
What stakeholders say?

• Local Services
  – Local Health and Community services strongly concerned that marginalised and vulnerable clients have been disconnecting from services.
What stakeholders say?

• Local Street Drinkers
  – No real effect for them
  – Become ‘more careful’ about some activities (like drinking and passing drugs between people)
  – Meeting in groups out of the camera zones.
Summary – Perceptions of Safety

• Overall Perceptions of Safety have improved since CCTV

• Perceptions of safety at night have by 11% - score still less than 5 so most consider unsafe.

• POS among women (25%) and business owners (46%)

• For people aged 60+, 15-19 and international students POS
Reducing Anti Social Behaviour

• ‘Anti Social Behaviour’ generally refers to any type of behavior that annoys, threatens, disturbs or interferes with the ability of people to go about their normal or lawful business – Australian Institute of Criminology

Proxy measures for the evaluation
• Improved perceptions of safety in Footscray Central
• Reduction in graffiti clean ups in Footscray Central
In camera zone  Out of camera zone

Commencement of CCTV operations (July 11)
• **Street Drinking**

• There was no significant change in behaviour around alcohol consumption.
• Violence and anti-social behaviour mostly directed to other drinkers.
• Larger gatherings of drinkers have moved to outside camera zone.
• Cameras have provided police with the capacity to more closely monitor these groups of public drinkers and to intervene quickly if aggressive, loud or other anti-social behaviour emerges.
Reducing Crime

CAD calls for crimes against the person in camera zone and outside camera zone

CAD calls for burglaries in camera zone and outside camera zone
Disrupt the street based drug trade

Manufacture, cultivation and trafficking of drugs in Yarra, Maribyrnong and Brimbank
Disrupt the street based drug trade

Possession and use of drugs in Yarra, Maribyrnong and Brimbank

- Brimbank
- Linear (Brimbank)
- Maribyrnong
- Linear (Maribyrnong)
- Yarra
- Linear (Yarra)

commencement of CCTV - June 2011
Disrupt the street based drug trade

Syringe collections inside and up to a kilometer outside the camera zone
Disrupt the street based drug trade

Drug related call outs in camera and outside camera zone
Two surveys were developed, piloted and distributed to Footscray Police officers to collect data about how the CCTV system was being used. One survey, a General User Survey, asked questions about the system use and usability, including proactivity, and was distributed to officers who were general users of the CCTV system. The second survey, a police Systems User Survey, was distributed to officers who had requested footage from the system. Elements of proactivity were tested in the second survey, but the focus of this survey was about use of the system to obtain convictions, and related to objective six. This data tested some dimensions of proactivity, but also serves as an end user satisfaction survey, providing considerable data about the usefulness of the system from a police perspective.
Support Proactive Policing

How CCTV has assisted police

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Uses of the system</th>
<th>Rarely</th>
<th>Sometimes</th>
<th>Often</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Identify an offender</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arrest an offender</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prevent a violent situation developing</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prepare a brief of evidence</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prevent Anti Social Behaviour</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deter drug or alcohol use in the CBD</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Support Proactive Policing

Usefulness rating of various aspects of the system by general users

![Bar chart showing usefulness ratings of different aspects of the system.](chart.png)
Gather evidence to support Police prosecutions

Identify suspect
Charge the suspect
Suspect made a full admission
Suspect made a partial admission
Full contest was avoided
Used in Court
assisted to secure a conviction in Court

Use number one
Use number two
Use number three
Use number four
Summary

• **Perceptions of safety have improved** in the camera zone relative to perceptions of safety in Maribyrnong in general.

• **Other strategies**, such as increased presence of police, improved lighting and increased presence of other people have also had a positive impact on perceptions of safety.

• The **strongest value** of the system has been in **supporting police operations**. The System has assisted Police in both prosecutions and proactive policing to prevent crime.
Summary

- The street based **drug trade** in central Footscray has been **disrupted**.
- There has been a **reduction in residential burglaries** and drug trafficking.
- There has also been a level of **crime displacement** of crime activity to outside the CCTV area and beyond the municipality particularly in relation to drug related crime.
Conclusion

• The CCTV system is intended to complement existing initiatives and programs currently being conducted by Council, Victoria Police and other stakeholders to improve perceptions of safety and to reduce the amount of street level crime that occurs in Footscray.
Questions